
THE TREND OF WESTERN HADITH STUDIES FROM THE BEGINNING TO THE PRESENT TIME FOCUSING ON IMAMIYYA HADITH**Ali Hasannia^{1*}, Ali Rad², Seyyed Mohammad Musavi Moqaddam²**¹Department of Quran and Hadith sciences, Shahed University, Iran.²Hadith and Qur'anic Sciences Department, College Farabi, University of Tehran, Iran*Corresponding author

ABSTRACT

Knowing the historical periods of studies and researches performed by orientalists on Shi'a narratives is an introduction to the discovery of ideas, thoughts, approaches, and turning points in every period. Concerning the historical and evolutionary trend of orientalists, works, four periods of time can be imagined as to the outcomes of considerations, researches, and the ideas presented in this regard which may overlap. There are also some points in every period of time at which a new approach appears. The important historical points are the beginning of every period which may be located sometimes when a research is performed, an orientalist is emerged, or when an event is happened. The present text aims at locating the turning point in every period of time in order to investigate the beginning and the end of the periods. This research intends to introduce the dominant trend in every period and to represent a clear image of the western studies and works on Shi'a narratives from the beginning to the present time.

Keywords: Hadith study, orientalists, historical trend, Shi'a.

Introduction

The In order to achieve a clear and right understanding of the whole works and activities of orientalists (Motzki, 2010) on the subject of Shi'a narratives, different areas should be investigated. The areas can be studied from different historical, social, approach, subject matter, and methodological aspects (Rad, 2010). Therefore, to have a conclusive and right look at the whole works, each aspect works as a part of a multi-section puzzle of the western studies on the Shi'a narratives. What has been investigated yet in the previous researches was the recognition of their research variants, titles, and written works on this subject (Hassania, 2015). Now we intend to deeply investigate the relatively huge literature in order to find some cases which can help us obtain a relatively complete and comprehensive idea among those works. What is important and deserves thinking is the review and analysis of the evolution and the trend of research of the works over the time; in another words by reviewing the historical trend of writings from the beginning to the end, especially the most efficient researches written by the eminent and outstanding orientalists, some aspects of researches over the time and the way they have been changed during the early and late years have been

studies, and finally the imaginable approaches at every period and a collection of writings with those approaches have been discovered (Motzki, 2010, p. 11). As a result, knowing this "evolutionary approach" and "gradual-historical evolution" will provide a clear image of the researches. In addition, knowing the evolutionary trend of the works will help us discover the hidden relations among orientalists in studying Shi'a; since the Shi'a hadith studies have been undoubtedly influenced by their need in the area of Shi'a studies which roots from Imamiyya studies and previous Shi'a studies in the West. Meanwhile, it is not unlikely that Shi'a studies, as a subject that has been less frequently studied in recent decades, has been considered as a marginal study in Islamic studies and religious literature, whereas a considerable amount of researches has been performed on Sunni Islam or western studies of the Quran. In another words, a relatively considerable amount of researches in the area of Shi'a hadith has been performed through a gradual evolutionary trend and passing through periods of Islam and Shi'a studies and we see, in the recent years, a considerable amount of independent researches in this area, although it is much less than that of Sunni Hadith (Hassania, 2015, p. 1). Concerning the

historical and evolutionary trend of Shi'a studies in the West and specifically Shi'a Hadith studies, both written (articles, books, and academic thesis) and unwritten works (seminars, seats of research, etc.), four periods of time can be imagined totally:

The first period: Annunciation approach to Hadith study (1186-1874)

The first period belongs to the time when the Shi'a became the focus of attention for the first time during the conflict between the Christian and the Muslims in the crusades. Next, at the time of Safavids' ruling motivations to pay more attention to this matter increased and during the next centuries the first researches on the narrative texts of Twelver Shi'a [twelver or Imamiyyah is the largest branch of Shia Islam. The term Twelver refers to its adherents' belief in twelve divinely ordained leaders, known as the Twelve Imams, and their belief that the last Imam, Muhammad al-Mahdi, lives in occultation and will reappear as the promised Mahdi], though very little, were done. This period lasted for about seven centuries from the late second to the late nineteenth century. What is apparent in the struggles between the Christians and the Muslims is the presence of Christian priests and evangelists who attempted to know this group of Muslims, i.e. the Shi'a. Their attempts to know the Shi'a in the general sense gradually led to know the Twelver Shi'a and their well-known texts. Of course their attempts are not even the minimum studies on Shi'a hadith, but since they are the West' first attention to Shi'a, they can be considered as a prelude to the future approaches to Shi'a narrative studies. Meanwhile, knowing the Western's evolutionary trend of Shi'a hadith studies requires to know the first streaks of this long evolutionary trend.

The early studies of the narrative texts of the Twelver Shi'a

In the second half of the nineteenth century, attempts were made to gain access to the early manuscripts intended to be placed in personal libraries and collections or to revise and

translate the Shi'a texts, of course it was a scattered and unwillingly move. None of the great European libraries gave prominence to buying original manuscripts about Twelver Shi'a and publication of Shi'a texts, whether original intact texts or their translations, continued in the same manner and in most cases thanks to the creativity of personal researchers. Nevertheless, the translation and identification of Shi'a texts have never been seriously considered and they remained unknown to the Western researchers. When Alwart, for example, referred, for the first time, in his preface to the original Arabic manuscripts- it is under the ownership of Royal Academy of Berlin- to Mohammad Baqer Majlesi's book "*Biḥār al-Anvār*", which was written in Safavid period, "Majlesi" was mistakenly taken as "Talebi", the author of the famous book of Qaṣā' al-Anbiyā (Hassania, 2015).

The second period: A traditional text-based approach to the minimum balanced studies (1874-1979)

The second imaginable period of western Shi'a hadith studies returns back to the time of emergence of famous Hungarian orientalist and scholar of Islam, Goldsiher (Shini Mirza, 2006), in the late 19th century who made a wide range of studies on Islam. His studies were followed up in Strasbourg conference as an important historical event of independent Twelver Shi'a studies. As a result, although the orientalist had previously a marginal look at their Shi'a studies, the orientalist and the researcher of Twelver Shi'a, Etan Kohlberg, made a wide range of studies and researches on Twelver Shi'a in the late 20th century and before the Islamic revolution of Iran. This period lasted for about one century which is the prelude to the minimum Shi'a hadith studies.

Emergence of the doctrine of doubt

The first western Shi'a hadith studies may return back to the time of some researchers like the Hungarian orientalist, Goldziher in 1850-1921 (Davari, 2006, p. 12; Badavi, 1998, p.519). He was among the first researchers

who gave prominence to the Shi'a hadith. Although studying the Shi'a was not his major branch of studies, he showed compelling interest to this subject and his Shi'a studies have been at least based on Hadith literature and researches. The fact that most of his ideas have continued today indicates the extent of his knowledge and insight. For instance, his three major books on the study of Islam, namely "Islamic studies", "An introduction to the Islamic theology and law", and "The methods of the exegesis of the Quran" are among the important classic sources to the European scholars of Islam. His work began with the publication of a detailed article on the debates between the Sunni and the Shi'a in 1874, i.e. the time when he was only 24 years old. Following that he wrote further articles on Shi'a-specific issues including "sacrilegious and disgraceful words the Shi'as applied against the first Caliphs", "taqiyya theory [precautionary concealment of one's faith]", "differentiation between prophetic (Nāṭiq) Imam and Silent (Ṣāmit) Imam" (Kohlberg, 1975). The writings of Goldziher mostly pertained to the Islamic and Hadith studies in a general sense. Nevertheless, his studies are mostly dealt with Sunni hadith and as to the Shi'a hadith he only referred to them as an example. Kohlberg believes that Goldziher did its best to gain access to the original classical sources of Shi'a hadith, but apparently he could not have access to two volumes of Kāfir's book. In his belief, Goldziher, beside his Sunni studies, made a balanced study of Shi'a sources to the extent it was needed and had access to the Shi'a sources (Kohlberg, 1975). In order to review the political, social and juridical system of Islam, Goldziher studied Islamic texts and since he considered the Quran and Hadith as the noble sources of Islamic culture and civilization he focused on studying these two sources. Of course he never acknowledged the genuineness and originality of the sources; even he did his best to cast serious doubts on their authenticity and genuineness. It is said that (Parsa, 2009) this was the beginning of "a dubious approach to hadith studies" which has been advocated by some researchers like Schacht and

criticized by others like Nabia Abbott (1897-1981), Faut Sezgin (birth 1924), Muhammad Mustafa A'zami (birth 1930), and Johhan Fuck (1894-1974).

Strasbourg conference: Starting point of getting special attention to the Twelver Shi'a

The situation continued apparently until the second half of the 19th century when a conference was held on the Shi'a branch of Islam and most specifically "twelver Shi'a". The conference was held in 1968 and it is known as "Strasbourg conference". Two Shi'a scholars participated in the conference, namely "Seyyed Hussein Nasr" from Tehran who was well-known for his various works on the Shi'ism and Sufism, and the leader of Lebanon's Shi'as, "Imam Mousa Sadr", who has been written an article in Arabic about the current situation of the Shi'a communities of Lebanon and Syria. The publishers never had access to the summary of the article in France that was promised by Imam Mousa Sadr, so it was not referred to in the abstracts of the articles published in the conference. Nevertheless, their participation in the conference is indicative of a new stage of periodical discussions between the western researchers and their Shi'a counterparts (Kohlberg, 1975). Although Strasbourg conference, as Kohlberg defines, is considered an exceptional event, the fact is that Shi'ism, in spite of the great developments in the next decade, did not gain much prominence among Islamic studies until the revolution of Iran which made all of the researchers have a new look at this religion. This matter has been underlined in a number of Kohlberg's writings (Kohlberg, 1991). A great number of those who were first interested in hadith issues have digressed and only briefly mentioned Shi'a hadith as an example from the perspective and in the middle of their discussions of Sunni hadith studies. One of the researchers that we see most of his articles in the late period is M.J. Qester (1914-2010). His studies mostly dealt with the history, specially the history of Islam and the practice of the prophet Mohammad (S) (sunna). Nevertheless, he has

made use of Shi'a hadith in some of his writings. In his article "a bag of meat: study of an early Hadith" (Kister, 1970), for example, published in 1970, he only mentions briefly at the end of his discussions that two Shi'a scholars (Ibn Tawoos and Allame Saffar) see this tradition and they do not accept it (Kister, 1970, p. 274). His article "On the tablet of Wahb ibn Munabbih" published in 1974 is another example. In this article he studies a number of missing materials in Khoury's revision of the remaining parts of the biography of Wahb ibn Munabbih and mentions, in some cases, a number of Shi'a and Sunni narratives next to each other and shows their contrast. He also mentions some narrations quoted by Shi'as and the Sunnis next to each other. He mentions relatively more detailed Shi'a narratives in this article, but under the influence of his studies of Sunni books and the history of Islam, they are quoted by Sunni scholars (Kister, 1974).

Etan Kohlberg: Beginning of independent Shi'a Hadith studies

At the same time Etan Kohlberg emerges as a prominent researcher in the area of Imami Shi'a studies. He is called the head branch of western Shi'a Hadith studies and it is considered that all next researchers are followers of him (Motzki, 2010, p. 41). At the threshold of the great Islamic revolution of Iran he publishes three special works focusing on Twelvers Shi'a hadith which may be called the first independent researches in this area. In one of the articles "An unusual Shi'a isnad" published in 1974 he has presented an independent challenging discussion on the Imami rijāl (narrators of hadith) and sanad (chain of narrators). Considering the Shi'a belief of Imam (A.S) and the position of Imāmat (religious leadership) he regards quoting narratives from Imam (AS) by ordinary peoples as an unusual matter. Therefore, quoting a hadith from Imam Baqer (A.S) by Jābir Ibn Anṣārī is an unusual *isnad* discussed here (Kohlberg, 1974, p. 142). In another article "Some Imāmī-shī'ī Views on Taqiyya" also published in 1975, he specifically mentions some of the Shi'a

narratives on taqiyya approach (Kohlberg, 1975). His third work, an important challenging article, titled "From Imamiyya to Ithna' Ashariyya" published at the threshold of the victory of Islamic revolution in 1976 which specifically discusses the Imami- Shi'a scholars, dealing with the issue of Occultation [Occultation refers to a belief that the messianic figure, or Mahdi, who in Shi'i thought is an infallible male descendant of the founder of Islam, Muhammad, was born but disappeared, and will one day return and fill the world with justice and peace.] and Twelvers as well as some other issues like Waqifite [The Waqifite Shi'a were a Shi'a sect who accepted the Imamate of Musa al-Kadhim, but refused to accept the Imamate of his successor Ali ar-Ridha] (Kohlberg, 1976 a). At first, even the least attention was not paid to the Shi'a but later on the introduction of Shi'a and Shi'a hadiths improved a little. Of course, Ismā'īlism [Ismā'īliyya is a branch of Shi'a Islam. The Ismā'īlī get their name from their acceptance of Imam Isma'il ibn Jafar as the appointed spiritual successor (Imām) to Ja'far al-Sadiq, wherein they differ from the Twelvers who accept Musa al-Kadhim, younger brother of Isma'il, as the true Imām] has been more referred to than Twelvers. Clarifying the issue and referring to the works of Robson, Juynboll and Barton about Shi'a Hadith (Beeston, 1983), Newman reminds that except Robeson's work in which he made a reference to The Four Books [Al-Kutub Al-Arb'ah is a Twelver Shia term referring to their four best-known hadith collections], but not separated them from the narrative collections specific to the Twelvers, no reference has been made to the Twelver Shi'a Hadiths by others (Newman, 2000).

The third period: independent studies of Imamiyya hadith focusing on Shi'a internal structures (1979-2000).

During the great Islamic revolution of Iran in 1979 and a little before that time, because of the great revolution and its influence on

ending the dominance of the western and eastern imperialism, it drew global attention specifically the attention of researchers. A brief study of the titles and the subjects of the written texts during the victory of the revolution (1979) and two next decades (until 2000) indicates a reverse of the subject-matters of the western Shi'a hadith studies. The subject-matters which pertain mostly to the recognition of Shi'a principles and beliefs, specifically the ruling Shi'as in Iran during these two decades can be divided into several parts:

Imami Shi'a as a doctrine of political-jurisprudence

At the threshold of the victory of the revolution, studies have been done which mostly dealt with the issues of Jihad (holy war), Twelver Shiism, and wilayat-e Faqih (guardianship of the Islamic jurist). The western view of the Iranian Imami shi'a government based on political jurisprudence and the leading doctrines of Imam Khomeini about guardianship of the Islamic jurist and the link between politics and jurisprudence made them write articles and books about the different aspects of this kind of shi'a thinking. An article by Etan Kohlberg "Development of the Imami Shi'i Doctrine of Jihad" (Kohlberg, 1976 b) published at the threshold of the victory of Islamic revolution and a text written by Norman Calder "Judicial authority in Imami Shi'i jurisprudence" published a year after the victory of Islamic revolution in 1980 are among a few examples (Calder, 1979). Kohlberg's article "From Imamiyya to Ithna' Ashariyya", referred to earlier, is also another good example which refers to the origins of the doctrine of Ithna' Ashariyya. In fact, Etan Kohlberg and the late Norman Calder can be called the pioneers of writing independent detailed works on Shi'a hadith. Kohlberg, following his peers like Qester, wrote many articles during the victory of Islamic revolution of Iran.

Imami Shi'a against the people of Jama'at (Sunni)

After the victory of Islamic revolution of Iran, the discussions turns considerably into the

challenging matters between the Shi'a and the Sunni, as well as the historical analyses of the origins, beliefs, and the history of Shi'a. Kohlberg's articles "Abū Turāb" (Kohlberg, 1978), "The Term 'Rafida' in Imāmī Shī'ī Usage" (Kohlberg, 1979 a) and "The Term Muhaddith in Twelver Shi'ism" (Kohlberg, 1979 b), "Some Imāmī Views on the Sahāba" (Kohlberg, 1984) are among a few examples. Looking at the titles of some other examples makes the situation clear:

- Etan Kohlberg, "Akhbārīya", 1984.
- McEoin (1984), "Aspects of Militancy and Quietism in Imami Shi'ism".
- Kohlberg (1985a), "The position of the walad al-zinā in Imāmī Shī'ism".
- Kohlberg (1985b), "Non-Imāmī Muslims in Imāmī Figh".
- Kohlberg (1986a), "Barā'a in Shī'ī Doctrine".
- Sharon (1986b), "Ahl al-Bayt- People of the House".
- Ayoub (1986c), "Divine Preordination and Human Hope: a Study of the Concept of Bada, in Imami Shiia Tradition".
- Kohlberg (1987 a), "Aspects of Akhbari Thought in Seventeenth and Eighteenth Centuries".
- Moosa (1988), "Extremist Shiites: The Ghulat sects".
- Moreen (1990), "Salman-i farisi and the jews: An anti-jewish shi'i hadith from the seventeenth century".
- Newman (1992a), "The Nature of the Akhbari/Usuli Dispute in Late-Safawid Iran. Part One: Abdallah al-Samahiji's 'Munyat al-Mumirisin'".
- Newman (1992b), "The Nature of the Akhbari/Usuli in Late-Safawid Iran. Part Two: The Conflict Reassessed".

Other subjects like the idea of the waiting Mahdi (May God expedite his advent) and Occultation of the Imam of the Time (A.S) are discussed and reviewed in the shi'a history and are compared with the ideas and beliefs of other sects like Sunni. The writing of

Kohlberg's article "Some Shi'i Views of The Antediluvian World" (Kohlberg, 1980), Uri Rubin's article "Prophets and Progenitors in Early Shi'a Tradition" (Rubin, 1979), and Abdulaziz Sachedina's article "Islamic Messianism: The idea of Mahdi in Twelver Shi'ism" (Sachedina, 1981) are among some examples. Meanwhile, Calder and Mohammad Ayyub wrote a number of articles about Imam Mahdi (May God expedite his advent) and Sachedina's work in the same year (Hasannia, 2015, p. 1-4). The interesting point at this time is that the titles of the western studies gradually get the color of Imamiyya and Twelver Shi'ism and the words like "shi'a Hadith" or "Imami jurisprudence" appear repeatedly in the articles. In the next years, this subject is even highlighted and is focused more specifically on Imami Shi'ism.

Paying attention to the important Shi'a hadith writings

The review and the criticism of the Shi'a hadith writings began several years after the victory of the Islamic revolution of Iran and were confined to a number of basic and main books. The first studies in this area focused on two important books, namely Nahjulbilāgha and Ṣaḥīfah Al-Sajjadiyya, every one of which contains the narratives and sayings of two Shi'a Imams; Imam 'Alī (A.S) and Imam Sajjād (A.S). In his doctoral thesis, Seyyed Mohammad Warith made a critical study of Nahjulbilāgha (Hassan, 1979) (i.e in the year of the victory of Iranian revolution) and in the introduction to his translation of Ṣaḥīfah Al-Sajjadiyya (Chittick, 1988), William Chittick studied the life of Imam Sajjād (A.S) and the importance and the position of the book. The most important books reviewed in these years after two above-mentioned books were, in the first place, the book "Shi'a Al-Usūl al-Arba'umi'a" which was reviewed and criticized in detail in Kohlberg's article "Al-Usūl al-Arba'umi'a" (Kohlberg, 1987 b) and next, Kohlberg's another article "Behār al-'Anwār" (Kohlberg, 1989). In addition, two impressing works of Mohammad Ali Amir-Moezzi's "Al-Saffar al-Qummi and Kitab basa'ir al-darajat" (Amir-Moezzi, 1992) and

Kohlberg's "Ibn Ṭāwūs's A medieval Muslim scholar at work: Ibn Ṭāwūs and his library" (Kohlberg, 1992) are among the works focusing specifically on the Shi'a sources and written legacy which include several discussions on Hadith.

These are only a few examples of activities in this area. Various articles written in different encyclopedias like Iranica may be added to the following list:

- Kohlberg (1994a), "Authoritative Scripture in Early Imami Shiism".
- Kohlberg (1994b), "Al-Darī'a elā Tasānīf al-Sī'a".
- Afsaruddin (1995), "An Insight into the Hadīth Methodology of Jamāl al-Dīn Aḥmad b. Ṭāwūs".

Writing of the first comprehensive Shi'a Hadith study

The first independent and comprehensive Shi'a Hadith study of Kohlberg (1983). This is certainly the first study in this area that investigates exclusively the different aspects of Shi'a narratives. There are a number of researches in the same years analyzing and reporting the western activities in this area, some of which have a general and some others a specific look at the Shi'a, including the following:

- Anees and Athar (1986), Guide to Sira and Hadith Literature in Western Languages.
- Kohlberg (1987c), "Western Studies of Shi'a Islam".
- Kohlberg (1991), "Belief and Law in Imāmī Shīism".

Every one of the above-mentioned studies includes a collection of articles and researches written by the orientalist in the previous years. A specific subject has been selected and compiled by the head editor of each collection according to his taste. The interesting point is that the issue of Shi'a hadith has been mentioned independently in every one of the above-mentioned collections which include generally some of the Shi'a and more specifically Twelver Shi'a hadith studies and researches.

Beginning of specialized studies

The specialized case articles on Shi'a hadith can be mentioned in this period. The articles and books have a specialized look at the Shi'a hadith and have investigated a point of the history of Shi'a hadith. In fact, they differ from the previous writings in that a great part of writings in the previous years has been done because of a taste for and to know the twelver Shi'a. To put it another word, if a research was done, for example, on Nahjulbilāgha, Ṣaḥīfa Al-Sajjādiyya, or another narrative book it was a scattered case study whose researcher has not performed it through a systematic academic research process. Meanwhile, the issue of hadith study has not been focused specifically enough by most of the writings. But on the other hand, the systematic academic researches, like the ones of Kohlberg or the ones of Killio, Newman, and Lalani at the universities of England, have been performed through a regular systematic academic study of the issues focusing on narratives. A major part of writings has been done in late 90's decade of the 20th century. The following are some examples:

- Ispahany, translator & editor Newman (1991), editor. "Islamic medical wisdom: the Ṭibb al-a'imma".
- Crow (1996), "The Role Of Al-'Aql In Early Islamic Wisdom With Reference To Imam Ja'far Al-Sadiq".
- Buckley (1997), "The Early Shiite Ghulat".
- Amir-Moezzi (1997), "Remarks on the authenticity of the criteria of Hadīth and the authority of jurist in Imamiyya shiism".
- Buckley (1998), "On the origins of Shī'i Hadīth".
- Firestone (1998), "Merits, Mimesis, and Martyrdom: Aspects of Shi'ite Meta-historical Exegesis on Abraham's Sacrifice in Light of Jewish, Christian, and Sunni Muslim Tradition".
- Buckley (1999), "Ja'far Al-Sadiq as a Source of Shi'i Traditions".
- Kohlberg (1999), "Fazl b. Sadan Nīsapūrī Azdī, Abū Mohammad".

- Newman (1999a), "Clerical Perceptions of Sufi Practices in Late Seventeenth-Century Persia: Arguments over the Permissibility of Singing (Ghina)".
- Newman (1999b), "Sufism and Anti-Sufism in Safavid Iran: The Authorship of the 'Hadiqat al-Shi'a' Revisited".

In the above-mentioned examples, the researches of Buckley that dealt specifically with the trend of narratives at the time of Imam Sadiq (A.S) and the writings of Newman and Kohlberg refer considerably to the minimum system of narrative studies. The interesting point is the emergence of Amir-Moezzi in these years and his paying attention to the Shi'a hadith (Hasannia, 2015). As a whole, such a writings, each of which dealt with a specific independent shi'a narrative, word, issue, and case, continued to about 2000. The review of the collections of the works of this period indicates that their authors were increasingly interested in the shi'a issues and discussions, from among a series of narratives, after the victory of Islamic revolution of Iran. The imaginable dominant approach in this period has shown, from among narrative texts, a tendency toward the shi'a logical discussions and knowing its principles and beliefs. Therefore, it seems appropriate to call it a new period of shi'a hadith studies. Calling the researchers of this period the "modernists", Newman believes that following the first group, i.e. the "traditionalists", the "modernists" were seeking to identify the practical and mostly political requirements and consequences of these beliefs after the victory of Islamic revolution of Iran. The "modernists" made researches on the issues pertaining to the authority of the clerics and the political legitimacy of the government, studying the shi'a specifications generally and the Iranian experience after the victory specifically (Newman, 2013, p. 71-73).

The fourth period: specialized, systematic studies: an approach to deeply recognize the shi'a (from 2000 to the present time)

In the early years of the 21st century we witness the emergence of several specialized systematic works on the shi'a hadith specifically the twelver shi'a that developed into a series of specialized and influential subjects during later studies. The studies performed in the same period can also be divided into several groups:

The history of hadith and the new specialized subjects

Two different major influential works of Arzina Lalani (2000) opened a new door to the shi'a studies. Lalani's "Early Shī'ī thought: The teachings of Imam Muḥammad al-Bāqir" that deals with the life, narratives, and the time of Imam Muḥammad al-Bāqir and Andrew Newman's "The formative period of Twelver Shī'ism: Ḥadīth as discourse between Qum and Baghdad." (Newman, 2013), which is the first comprehensive book on the early Twelver Shī'a narratives, are considered new approaches to the shi'a hadith studies. In fact writing this book, Newman drew attentions to the specialized study of Oṣūl Kāfī and three other Shī'a books which became very good examples of further systematic studies in the next years. In the same year, the Waqifa-specific Shi'a issues have been discussed by some of the researchers like Büyükkara (2000) in his article "The Schism in the Party of Mūsa al-Kazim and the Emergence of the Waqifa" and Jarrar (2000) in his article "Sīrat Ahl al-Kisā: Early Shī'ī Sources on the Biography of the Prophet". In the next years, the issues became even more specialized in the writings of others like Gleave's article (2001) "Link Between Ḥadīth and Fiqh: The "Canonical" Imāmī Collections of Akhbār", which deals with the Shi'a hadith with a comparative study of the narratives of Oṣūl Kāfī and Sheikh Mofīf's Al-Moqni'ah, and Gleave's book "Scripturalist Islam; The History and Doctrines of the Akhbari Shi'i School" (Gleave, 2007) which also deals with specific

aspects of the history of Shi'a hadith, as well as Haider's book (2011) "The Origins of The Shi'a, Identity, Ritual, and Sacred Space in Eight Century Kūfa, (chapter: Kūfa and the Classical Narratives of Early Shī'ism). The specific study of the important Shi'a Hadith books and the biography of the Shi'a traditionalists (*muhaddith*) are seen in this period. The above-mentioned works of Newman and Gleave are among a few examples. Muhammad Ismail Marcinkowski's articles "Al-Kulayni and his Early Twelver-Shi'ite Hadith-Compendium Al-Kafi: Selected Aspects of the Part Al-Usul min al-Kafi" (Marcinkowski, 2000), "Twelver Shiite Scholarship and Buyid Domination. A Glance on the Life and Times of Ibn Babawayh al-Shaykh al-Saduq" (Marcinkowski, 2001a), "Rapprochement and Fealty during the Buyids and Early Saljuqs: The Life and Times of Muhammad ibn al-Hasan al-Tusi" (Marcinkowski, 2001b), Etan Kohlberg's article "Revelation and Falsification: Introduction to the book of al-qiraat d'al-Sayyari" (Kohlberg, 2005), Roy Vilozny's article "A Shi'i Life Cycle according to al-Barqi's kitab al-Mahasin" (Vilozny, 2007), Mohammad Ali Amir-Moezzi and Hassan Ansari's article (2009) "Muḥammad b. Ya'qūb al-Kulaynī and his Kitāb al-Kāfī", and Wilferd Madelung's article "Early Imāmī Theology as Reflected in the Kitāb al-kāfī of al-Kulaynī" (Madelung, 2013) are also further examples in this area. For this purpose and for dating the narratives, the fundamental Shi'a hadith books (Oṣūl Arba'ami'a) have also been considered by some of the researchers. Maybe the most fundamental and the most important work in this area is the first volume of Mohammad Hossein Modarressi Tabatabaie's book "Tradition and Survival, a Bibliographical Survey of Early Shiite Literature" (Modarressi Tabatabai, 2003) that studied the origins of narratives on fundamental principles in the early books. The article by the professor of Stanford University, Behnam Sadeghi (2009), "The traveling tradition test: a method for dating traditions", can be mentioned as another example.

Principles and foundations of Shi'a hadith

There are also other writings focusing on the Shi'a fundamentals and principles which are less or rarely observed in the previous works. Muhammad Ali Emir-Muezzi's article "The authenticity of the Imamiyya Shi'a hadith and evaluation of the criteria related to the authority of the jurist" (Emir-Muezzi, 2003), two articles by Büyükkara, namely "The fundamentals of the Imamiyya Shi'a hadith: the study of the counterfeit collections of the Imamiyya Shi'a hadith (1): the methodology evaluation" (Büyükkara, 2005), Rainer Brunner's article "The Role of Hadith as Cultural Memory in Shi'a" (Brunner, 2005) which focuses on the specific study of Biḥār, Liyaqat Takim's article "The Origins and Evaluations of Hadith Transmitters in Shi'i Biographical Literature" (Takim, 2007), Ronald Buckley's article "The morphology and significance of some Imami Shi'ite traditions" (Buckley, 2007), the critical and precious book by Jonathan Brown "Hadith: Muhammad's legacy in the medieval and modern world" (Brown, 2009) which has an independent chapter (bāb) of the Shi'a hadith, and Robert Gleave's article "Literal Meaning and Interpretation in Early Imāmī Law" (Gleave, 2014) all refer to and stress on the fundamentals and principles of Shi'a hadith. The later, specifically, has a clearer historical view of the Shi'a hadith.

Collection of works

Although the trend of studies continued in the same specialized way in the recent years, writing of collections containing the materials of the early orientalists also has taken its special form; like Farhad Daftary's two volumes of the book "The Study of Shi'i Islam" (Daftary, 2014). The second volume of the book contains an independent chapter along with several articles on the Shi'a hadith including the major article "An introduction to the Shi'a hadith" by Etan Kohlberg as the head editor. Karim Douglas Crow also wrote the book "Shiite Hadith Bibliography: An Introduction" (Crow, 2013), studying the Shi'a hadith books and having a look into the western works in this area.

Scattered case studies

We see, on the other hand, that the scattered case studies on the Shi'a continue in the same period. There are many cases of the studies that like the previous period deal with the beliefs, doctrines, and principles of the twelver Shi'a; including jihād (holy war), taqiyya (precautionary concealment of one's faith), bidā', wisdom, ijtihād (the process of deriving the laws of the sharī'a from its sources) as well as other scattered issues (Hasannia, 2015). The interesting point is that these studies also discuss very specific small subjects, for instance "The Donkey of the Prophet in Shī'ite Tradition" (Sindawī, 2006) and "The Queen of Sheba in Shi'a Hadith" (Inloes, 2012), or a specific shi'a character (like the narrator A'bdollah ibn-Sabā) and other subjects (like the articles of "An Even Better Creation: The Role of Adam and Eve in Shi'i Narratives about Fatimah al-Zahra" (Ruffle, 2013), "Among the Chosen Cities: Tiflisi in the Shi'i Tradition" (Beradze, 2008) and "Shi'i traditions about Hadrat Ibrahim (peace be upon him)" (Büyükkara, 1998). New subjects have also been developed in recent years like the inhibition and compilation of Shi'a hadith which, of course, need further and more serious works in this area. Maria Massi Dakake's article "Writing and Resistance: The Transmission of Religious Knowledge in Early Shi'ism" (Dakake, 2008) and G.Miskinzoda's article "The Story of 'Pen and Paper' and its Interpretation in Muslim Literary and Historical Tradition" (Mishkinzoda, 2014), both written in 2013, are among some examples.

Conclusion

As a whole, four periods of orientalists' Shi'a hadith studies are imaginable: In the first period little studies were done taking announcement approach to Imam Ali (A.S). In the second period (1874-1979) traditional text-based approach has been taken to the minimum balanced studies and we see the first Shi'a hadith studies which led to the Twelver Shi'a studies in the second half of the 20th century. Holding Strasbourg conference and

emergence of figures like Qester and Kohlberg, who, as the leader, specifically took the control of the Western Imami studies in his hand in the next period, are considered the major events of this period. In the third period (1979-2000) independent Imami studies were done focusing on the Shi'a internal structures. The western researchers studied mostly the Shi'a principles and beliefs, specifically the ruling Shi'a in Iran. The researchers of this period are called "modernists" who were seeking to identify the practical and mostly

political requirements and consequences of Imami Shi'a-specific beliefs of the Islamic ruling party in Iran. Finally, there is the fourth period (from 2000 up to the present time) which is called the period of specialized systematic studies taking an approach to deeply recognize the Imamiyya. Naturally, in every one of the periods, important turning points can be explored that have influenced the trend of hadith studies of that and the next periods.

References

- Afsaruddin, A. (1995).** An Insight into the "Hadith" Methodology of Jamal al-Din Ahmad b. Tawus. *Der Islam; Zeitschrift für Geschichte und Kultur des Islamischen Orients*, 72, 24-25.
- Amir-Moezzi, M. A. (1992).** Al-Şaffâr al-Qummî (m. 290/902-3) et son Kitâb baş'ir al-darajât. *Journal Asiatique*, 280(3-4), 221-250.
- Amir-Moezzi, M. A. (1997).** Remarques sur les critères d'authenticité du hadîth et l'autorité du juriste dans le shi'isme imâmite. *Studia islamica*, 85, 5-39.
- Amir-Moezzi, M. A., & Ansari, H. (2009).** Muḥammad b. ya 'qūb al-kulaynī (M. 328 OU 329/939-40 OU 940-41) et son kitāb al-kāfī. une introduction. *Studia Iranica*, 38, 191-247.
- Anees, M. A., & Athar, A. N. (1986).** Guide to Sira and Hadith literature in Western languages. Burns & Oates.
- Ayoub, M. (1986 c).** Divine preordination and human hope a study of the concept of bada:'In imami shici tradition. *Journal of the American Oriental Society*, 106(4), 623-632.
- Badavi, A. (1998).** Encyclopedia of orientalist. Rozane publications, Tehran, first edition, Iran.
- Beeston, A. F. L. (1983).** Arabic literature to the end of the Umayyad period (Vol. 1). Cambridge University Press.
- Beradze, G. (2008).** Among the Chosen Cities: Tbilisi in the Shi'i Tradition. *Journal of Persianate Studies*, 1(2), 206-217.
- Brown, J. A. (2009).** Hadith: Muhammad's legacy in the medieval and modern world. Oneworld Publications.
- Brunner, R. (2005).** The Role of Ḥadīth as Cultural Memory in Shī'ī History. *Jerusalem Studies in Arabic and Islam*, 30, 318-360.
- Buckley, R. P. (1997).** The Early Shiite Ghulat. *Journal of Semitic Studies*. . Publication link: 320fa56a-a2de-4967-9e00-f3e190014ea0.
- Buckley, R. P. (1998).** On the origins of Shīi Ḥadīth. *Muslim World*, 88(2), 165-184. DOI:10.1111/j.1478-1913.1998.tb03653.x. Publication link: 58f65332-0b0f-4d08-b187-d7359b7fa627.
- Buckley, R. P. (1999).** Ja' far Al-Sadiq as a Source of Shii Traditions. *The Islamic Quarterly*. Publication link: [922d4cf0-8206-4419-b759-1f5e092c4193](https://doi.org/10.1017/S0021871800004193).
- Buckley, R. P. (2007).** The Morphology and Significance of Some Imāmī Shī 'ite Traditions. *Journal of semitic studies*, 52(2), 301-334.
- Büyükkara, M. A. (1998).** Ali al-Rida's Allaged Link with the Sufi Maruf al-Karkhi and some Famous Poets. *Islamic Quarterly*, 42, 188-199.
- Buyukkara, M. A. (2000).** The Schism in the Party of Mūsā al-Kāzīm and the Emergence of the Wāqifa. *Arabica*, Vol. 1. 78-99.
- Büyükkara, M. A. (2005).** Imamyeye Sia' Sunin Hadis Usulunden "Mezhebi Bozuk".

- Calder, N. (1979).** Judicial authority in Imami Shi'i jurisprudence. *British Journal of Middle Eastern Studies*, 6(2), 104-108.
- Chittick, W. C. (1988).** *As-Sahifa Al-Kamilah Al-Sajjadiyya*.
- Crow, D. S. (1996).** The Role of Al-'Aql in Early Islamic Wisdom with Reference to Imam Ja'far Al-Şādiq.
- Crow, K. D. (2013).** *Shiite Hadith Bibliography: An Introduction*.
- Daftary, F. (Ed.). (2014).** *The Study of Shi'i Islam: History, Theology and Law (Vol. 2)*. IB Tauris.
- Dakake, M. M. (2008).** Writing and Resistance: The Transmission of Religious Knowledge in Early Shi'ism.
- Davari, M. (2006).** The image of Shia Imams in the Encyclopedia of Islam (translation and criticism). Qom, The institute of Shi'a studies, First edition, Iran.
- Emir-Muezzi, M. A. (2003).** İmâmî Şiilik'te Hadisin Sıhhat Kıstasları ve Fakîhin Otoritesine Dair Değerlendirmeler. *Uludağ Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi*, 12(2), 20-25.
- Firestone, R. (1998).** Merit, Mimesis, and Martyrdom: Aspects of Shi'ite Meta-Historical Exegesis on Abraham's Sacrifice in Light of Jewish, Christian, and Sunni Muslim Tradition. *Journal of the American Academy of Religion*, 66(1), 93-116.
- Gleave, R. (2001).** Between hadith and fiqh: the "canonical" imāmī collections of akhbār. *Islamic Law and Society*, 8(3), 350-382.
- Gleave, R. (2007).** *Scripturalist Islam; The History and Doctrines of the Akhbari Shi'i School*.
- Gleave, R. (2014).** *Literal Meaning and Interpretation in Early Imāmī Law*. In *Islamic Law in Theory* (pp. 231-255). Brill.
- Haidar, N. (2011).** *The Origins of the Shī'a: Identity, Ritual, and Sacred Space in Eighth-Century Kūfa*. Cambridge University Press.
- Hasannia, A. (2015).** *Critical analysis of Shi'a hadith in the view of orientalists*, (doctoral thesis), Tehran University, Pardis Farabi.
- Hassan, S. M. W. (1979).** A critical study of Nahj Al-Balagha.
- Inloes, A. (2012).** The Queen of Sheba in Shi'a Hadith. *Journal of Shi'a Islamic Studies*, 5(4), 423-440.
- Jarrar, M. (2000).** *Sīrat Ahl al-Kisā: Early Shī'i Sources on the Biography of the Prophet*. in *The Biography of Muḥammad: The Issue of the Sources*, ed. Harald Motzki, Leiden: E.J. Brill, 56, 98-153.
- Kister, M. J. (1970).** A Bag of Meat': A Study of an Early Hadīth. *Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies*, 33(2), 267-275.
- Kister, M. J. (1974).** On the papyrus of Wabb b. Munabbih. *Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies*, 37 (3), 545-571.
- Kohlberg, E (1984).** Akhbārīya. In *Iranica*.
- Kohlberg, E. (1974).** An Unusual Shi'i Isnad. *Israel Oriental Studies*, 5, 142-149.
- Kohlberg, E. (1975).** Some Imāmī-shī'i Views on Taqiyya. *Journal of the American Oriental Society*, 95(3), 395-402.
- Kohlberg, E. (1976a).** From Imāmiyya to Ithnā-'ashariyya. *Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies*. 9 (3), 521-534.
- Kohlberg, E. (1976b).** The Development of the Imāmī Shī'i Doctrine of jihād. *Zeitschrift der Deutschen Morgenländischen Gesellschaft*, 126(1), 64-86.
- Kohlberg, E. (1978).** Abū Turāb. *Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies*, 41(02), 347-352.
- Kohlberg, E. (1979a).** The Term Rāfida" in Imāmī Shī'i Usage. *Journal of the American Oriental Society*, 4(5), 677-679.
- Kohlberg, E. (1979b).** The term muhaddath in Twelver Shi'ism'. *Studia Orientalia memoriae DH Baneth dedicata* (Jerusalem: Magnes Press, 1979), 39-47.
- Kohlberg, E. (1980).** Some Shī'i Views of the Antediluvian World. *Studia Islamica*, 52, 41-66.
- Kohlberg, E. (1983).** *Shi'i Hadith. Arabic Literature to The End of Umayyad Period*.

- Kohlberg, E. (1985a).** The position of the walad zinā in Imāmī Shī'ism. *Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies*, 48(02), 237-266.
- Kohlberg, E. (1985b).** Non-Imami Muslims in Imami Fiqh. *Jerusalem Studies in Arabic and Islam*6, 99-105.
- Kohlberg, E. (1986a).** Bara'a in Shi'i Doctrine. *Jerusalem Studies in Arabic and Islam*, 7, 139-175.
- Kohlberg, E. (1987a).** Aspects of Akhbari thought in the Seventeenth and Eighteenth Centuries. *Eighteenth-Century Renewal*, 133-153.
- Kohlberg, E. (1987b).** Al-Usul al-Arba'umi'a. *Jerusalem Studies in Arabic and Islam*, 10, 128-66.
- Kohlberg, E. (1987c).** Western Studies of Shi'a Islam. *Shi'ism Resistance and Revolution*, 31-46.
- Kohlberg, E. (1989).** Behār al-'Anwār. in *Iranica*.
- Kohlberg, E. (1991).** Belief and law in Imāmī Shī'ism (Vol. 339). Variorum Publishing.
- Kohlberg, E. (1991).** The Evolution of the Shia", in: *Belief and Law in Imami Shi'ism*. Variorum Reprints, Aldershot.
- Kohlberg, E. (1992).** A medieval Muslim scholar at work: Ibn Ṭāwūs and his library (Vol. 12). Brill.
- Kohlberg, E. (1994a).** Authoritative scriptures in early Imami Shiism. *Les Retours Aux Ecritures: Fondamentalismes Presents Et Passes*.
- Kohlberg, E. (1994b).** Al-Darī'a elā Tasānīf al-Sī'a. in *Iranica*.
- Kohlberg, E. (1999).** Fazl b. Sadan Nīsapūrī Azdī, Abū Mohammad. in *Iranica*.
- Kohlberg, E. (2005).** Revelation et Falsification: Introduction a L'edition du Kitab al-qiraat d'al-Sayyari. in *Iranica*.
- Lalani, A. (2000).** Early Shī'ī Thought: The Teachings of Imam Muhammad al-Bāqir.
- Madelung, W. (2013).** Early Imāmī Theology as Reflected in the Kitāb al-kāfī of al-Kulaynī.
- Marcinkowski, M. I. (2000).** Al-Kulayni and his Early Twelver-Shī'ite Ḥadīth. *Compendium Al-Kāfī: Selected Aspects of the Part Al-Uṣūl min al-Kāfī*. *Islamic Culture*, 74(1), 89-126.
- Marcinkowski, M. I. (2001a).** Twelver Shi'ite scholarship and buyid domination. A glance on the life and times of Ibn Babawayh Al-Shaykh Al-Saduq (D. 381/991). *The Islamic quarterly*, 45(3), 199-222.
- Marcinkowski, M. I. (2001b).** Rapprochement and Fealty during the Būyids and Early Saljūqs: The Life and Times of Muḥammad ibn al-Ḥasan al-Ṭūsī. *Islamic studies*, 40(2), 273-296.
- McEoin, D. (1984).** Aspects of militancy and quietism in Imami Shi'ism. *British Journal of Middle Eastern Studies*, 11(1), 18-27.
- Mishkinzoda, G. (2014).** The Story of 'Pen and Paper' and Its Interpretation in Muslim Literary and Historical Tradition. *The Study of Shi'i Islam: History, Theology and Law*, 231-249.
- Modarressi Tabatabai, H. (2003).** Tradition and Survival: A Bibliographical Survey of Early Shi'ite Literature. Vol. 1, 20-35.
- Moosa, M. (1987).** Extremist Shiites: the ghulat sects. Syracuse University Press.
- Moreen, V. B. (1990).** Salman-i Farisi and the Jews-An anti-Jewish Shi'i Hadith from the 17th Century' *Irano-Judaica*, 2, 144-57.
- Motzki, H. (2010).** Islamic hadith: origins and evolutionary trend, tra, Dar al-Hadith Press, Qum, Iran.
- Newman, A. (2000).** The Formative Period of Twelver Shī'ism: Ḥadīth as Discourse between Qum and Baghdad. Richmond, Surrey.
- Newman, A. J. (1992a).** The Nature of the Akhbārī/Uṣūlī Dispute in Late Ṣafawid Iran. Part 1: 'Abdallāh al-Samāhijī's' *Munyat al-Mumārīsīn*. *Bulletin of the School of Oriental and African Studies, University of London*, 22-51.
- Newman, A. J. (1992b).** The Nature of the Akhbārī/Uṣūlī Dispute in Late Ṣafawid Iran. Part 2: The Conflict Reassessed. *Bulletin of*

the School of Oriental and African Studies, University of London, 250-261.

Newman, A. J. (1999a). Clerical Perceptions of Sufi Practices In Late Seventeenth-Century Persia. Arguments Over Permissibility of Singing (Ghinā'). *The Heritage of Sufism*, 3, 135-164.

Newman, A. J. (1999b). Sufism and Anti-Sufism in Safavid Iran: The Authorship of the "ʿadqat al-Shiʿa" Revisited. *Iran*, 37, 95-108.

Newman, A. J. (2013). The Formative Period of Twelver Shi'ism: Hadith as Discourse Between Qum and Baghdad. Routledge.

Newman, A. J. (Ed.). (1991). Islamic Medical Wisdom: The Ṭibb Al-a'imma. Muhammadi Trust.

Parsa, F. (2009). Hadith in the view of orientalists. Review and analysis of Harald Motzki's Hadith studies, Al-Zahra University, First edition, Tehran, Iran.

Rad, A. (2010). Hadith studies in orientalists. writings (Shia hadith, Fiqh al-Hadith, Kitabat and Isnad), *Hadith sciences*, 5(58), 204-238.

Rubin, U. (1979). Prophets and progenitors in the early Shi'a tradition. *Jerusalem Studies in Arabic and Islam*, 1, 41-65.

Ruffle, K. G. (2013). An even better creation: The role of Adam and Eve in Shi'i narratives about Fatimah Al-Zahra. *Journal of the American Academy of Religion*, 1ft047.

Sachedina, A. A. (1981). *Islamic messianism: the idea of Mahdi in Twelver Shi'ism*. SUNY Press.

Sadeghi, B. (2009). The Travelling Tradition Test: A Method for Dating Traditions. *Der Islam*, 85(1), 203-242.

Sharon, M. (1986 b). Ahl al-Bayt-People of the House'. *Jerusalem Studies in Arabic and Islam*, 8, 169-184.

Shini Mirza, S. (2006). Orientalists and hadith: Analysis of the views of Goldziher and Schacht, Tehran, Hastinema Press, first edition, Iran.

Sindawi, K. (2006). The Donkey of the Prophet in Shi'ite Tradition. *Al-Masāq*, 18(1), 87-98.

Takim, L. (2007). The Origins and Evaluations of Hadith Transmitters in Shii Biographical Literature. *American Journal of Islamic Social Sciences*, 24(4), 26.

Vilozny, R. (2007). A Šī'i Life Cycle according to al-Barqī's Kitāb al-Maḥāsin. *Arabica*, 54(3), 362-396.